

A SUMMATIVE EVALUATION OF THE HUMAN RESOURCES MANAGEMENT PROGRAM OF THE INDONESIAN COOPERATIVE MANAGEMENT INSTITUTE (IKOPIN)

By : Anwar Sitompul

I Back Ground

Leaders in the business world today have realized that of many resources they are concerned with like man, money, materials, machine and methods, man or human resources in the most vital (Sison, 1991).

To substantiate this utilization of human resources, Johnston and Mc. Clelland (1991) emphasized the demand for a world-class work plan in the 1990's for prosperity, enterprise and business growth. They believe that to succeed in international cooperative market, a nation should meet the following requirement : full investment in people, achievement of full potential by individuals, flourishing of enterprise and ideas, and accessibility and relevance of learning should also be stimulating.

According to law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 25 of the year 1992 concerning cooperative, published by Cooperative Department, explained that there were two principles, in developing the cooperative society it implement as well;

1. Co-operative education
2. Co-operative among co-operative societies

To enhance the role and participation of cooperative in the development of people's economy, the classical problems that should be immediately solve in low quality of human resources of cooperative, which bring specific problems as following :

1. Lack of access to information
2. Lack of access to market and lack to capability to expand market share
3. Lack of access to capital and weakness of capital structure
4. Lack of access to technology and lack of competence in utilization of technology
5. Lack of competence in developing organization and management

(Ministry of co-operative and SME and Ministry of Home Affairs, 1999)

According to Damand Prakash (1996) there are four major constraints to cooperative development in Indonesia namely : The first, lack of skilled professionally trained personnel, a second constraint that has frequently been referred to, is the lack of adequate financial resources and of capacity at the cooperative institute, a Third Constraint is the difficulty of cooperative to retain skilled staff.

In establishment and development of cooperative in Indonesia, government and cooperative movement has build Indonesia cooperative management institute (IKOPIN) in Jatinangor, Bandung West Java, by aims alumni or graduated its institute to be Manager in cooperative or other office as a cadet for development of cooperative in Indonesia.

Indonesian cooperative management institute (IKOPIN) establish on 7 may 1982, based on recommendation from Department of Education West Java number 0226/KOP/IV/N/1994, IKOPIN had three college following :

1. College of Finance/CMK
2. College of Human Resources Management/CMS
3. College of Marketing and Production Management/CMP

Curricular program always change and improved according to the demand of society and of the needs of the cooperative movement. Arrangement its will impact to education program. The institute offered human resources management a four year and half year program in school year 2000/2001 enrolment decreased to 98. This decreased in enrolment started in 1992/1993, thus these is need to evaluated the program. This is very important because the program was accredited "A" Augusts 11, 1998 based on recommendation letter of national college accreditation agency Department of Education and Culture Republic of Indonesia number 001/BAN-1/VIII/1998.

This research want to evaluate human resources management program of Indonesian Cooperative Management Institute (IKOPIN) by aim give information use as basic for :

1. Make policies and decision
2. To evaluate result of achieved by student
3. To evaluate curriculum
4. To give believed to student
5. To improve material and program of education

II Statement of The Problem

This study aim to evaluate the human resources management program of Indonesian Cooperative Management Institute. Specifically, the study address to the blowing areas of concerns :

1. CONTEXT EVALUATION

1.1.What is institutional vision-mission of the Indonesian co-operative management institute?

1.2.What are the goals and objectives of Human Resources Management program?

1.3.Do the goals and objectives of the program reflect the need for qualified human resource managers in the country?

2. INPUT EVALUATION

What is the profile of the student as regards

Age?

Gender?

Socio-economics background?

Nationality?

Needs and expectations of the Human Resource Management program?

What is the profile of the faculty who handle courses under the program in terms of :

Faculty development program participated?

Educational background?

Length of Teaching Experience?

Teaching performance?

How adequate are the following institute's facilities and instructional materials to meet the demands of students and teachers?

Books, professional journal and periodicals on human resource management's

Computer and software in human resource management

Curriculum

What are suggestion of the administration of teacher, student and alumni to improve the curriculum

3. PROCESS EVALUATION

What are the problems met by administrators, teachers and students during the implementations of program?

How did they overcome those problems?

What are the strength and weakness of the program based on the assessment of administrators, teachers, students and alumni?

Goals and objective?

Content or course?

Teaching strategies?

Out of school activities?

Evaluation of students?

4. PRODUCT EVALUATION

4.1. What is the profile of the graduates in terms of

- Employment status (managerial/non-managerial, probationary/permanent)
- Nature of employment?
- Length of time after graduation before getting first job?

Based on the assessment of the employers of graduates of the program :

What are the graduates strength and weakness as regards their job permonce?

4.2. What are their chances for promotion in their jobs?

4.3. What are the employers suggestions to improve or the preparation for work of the graduates of the program?

4.4. What relationship may be drawn between the output and process evaluation result?

III SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY

As a guidance for government in determined implementation planning and education program of Indonesian co-operative management institute specially on human resource management program, to make more efficiency and achieve the goals, according to mission and vision of institute for development of co-operative in Indonesia.

IV SCOPE AND LIMITATONS

The study will be focused only on the under graduated specify only Human Resource Management study program of Indonesian Cooperative Management Institute Following the CIPP Model area will be evaluate

Under Context :

- Vision-mission of the school
- Program goals and objectives

Under Input :

- Student profile
- Faculty profile
- Physical facilities

Under Process :

- Problems met during implemented and solution to indentified problems

Under Product :

- Employment status, length of time after graduation before getting the fist job, nature of first and present job (related/not related to human resource management) and strength and weakness of graduates based on employers feedback and relationship between context input, process and product

V Definition of Term

1. A cooperative society is a business enterprise having individuals on registered cooperative societies as members of which activities are based on cooperative principles and simultaneously as a people's economic movement based on the principles of brotherhood (Law of the Republic of Indonesia number 25 year of 1992 concerning cooperatives)
2. Cooperative education is study about norm of cooperative; so that the Republic know what cooperative are all about; the members know their right and responsibilities; the board members know their duties and their responsibilities; the staff are fully trained to perform their duties (Law of the Republic of Indonesia number 25 year of 1992 concerning cooperatives)
3. Management process of setting and achieving goals through planning, organizing, commanding, coordinating and controlling (Henry Fayol, 1925).

4. Evaluation is the process of delineating, obtaining and providing useful information for judging decision alternative delineating, obtaining providing information, the delineating and providing operations are carried out collaboratively between evaluator and decision maker (Daniel Stufflebeam, 1971).
5. Curriculum is totality of curricular content (Subject matter) and learning experiences the learner goes through to achieve intended educational purposes or outcomes against which is program will be evaluated (Flordeliza C. Reyes, 2000)
6. Vision is blueprint of a desired future state. It is the condition which enables managers to see that the world need not remain as it is – that it is possible, for it to be otherwise and to be better (Sheive at al, 1987).
7. Mission statement : enduring statement of purpose that distinguishes one organization from another. It embodies the philosophy, value and priorities of the organization. (Flordiliza C. Reyes, 2000).
8. Objectives is the long-term results that an organization seeks to achieve in pursuing its basic mission. Objectives should be challenging, measureable, consistent, reasonable and clear. (Godiwalla, et.al).
9. Goals are short-term (one year or less) milestones or benchmarks that organizations must achieve in order for longer-term objectives to be reached. Goals should be measureable, quantitative challenging, realistic, consistent and prioritized.
10. Culture are predominant behaviors and attitudes manifested by the employees as influenced by the mission, values, belief and norm.
11. Indonesian cooperative management institute (IKOPIN) this refer to institute consist of three college, educated student about cooperative management, established in Jatinangor, West Java Indonesia.

VI METHOD

This chapter will describe the research method, source of data, sampling procedures, instrument, procedures and data analysis

Research Method

The study will make use of the descriptive evaluative research. It will present the context input, process and product evaluation findings of the program under assessment.

Sources of Data

Source of data include survey questionnaire and interviews of the participants of Human Resource Management Program, as well as school demands concerning the institutional vision-mission and the curriculum of the human resource management program of IKOPIN.

Participants

All the administrator of the school in IKOPIN will be covered by the study. Random sampling will be done to evaluate the samples from student, teacher and alumni of the IKOPIN.

All the managers of the graduates who will be selected will also come as respondents of the study.

The sample from each the groups will be determined through the use of the standard formula in computing the sample size $= \frac{N}{1+Nxe^2}$. Research implement in Indonesian Co-operative Management Institute, Jatinangor Bandung, Weat Java Indonesia as following :

Table 1 : Types of Population, Number And Presentation of Respondent

No.	Types of Respondent	Population	Number of Respondent	%
1	President of institute	1	1	0,18
2	Dean	1	1	0,18
3	Administrators	3	3	0,54
4	Faculty	10	10	1,80
5	Students	487	220	39,63
6	Alumni	1521	317	57,12
7	Employers	3	3	0,55
	Total	2026	555	100

INSTRUMENTS

The instruments to be used in this study consist of two, namely; Questionnaire and Interview. Respondent consist of President of Institute, Dean, Administrator, Faculty, Student Alumni and employee. Total of population are 2026 persons and number of respondents all 555 persons. The data will be include the following :

1. Under Context :

Vision-mission, objective/goals; used school document on the human resource management.

2. Under Input :

Question for student and faculty respondent determined their profiles and their assessment of the faculties library got of the HRM of the school.

3. Under Process :

Questionnaire for administrator, faculty, student, regarding problem met during program implementation and how they over come or solve those problems.

4. Under Product :

Respondents are alumni of Indonesian Co-operative Management Institute specify human resource study program as manager in Co-operative and other office.

PROCEDURE

Data will be obtained from Indonesian Co-operative Management Institute. The Questionnaires to be constructed will be submitted to experts for face validation, and pilot tested to a small of respondents. These respondents will not be include in final study. After pilot testing items that are not clear, based on feedback of the respondents will be improved prior to actual use.

Table 2 : Research Procedure

Types of Evaluation	Needed Data	Data Gathering Procedure/Instrument	Data Analysis
Context	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Vision-Mission - Goals and objectives of HRM 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - School Document - HRM Curriculum 	Context analysis of congruent between vision-mission and goals & objectives of program
Input	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Student Profile - Faculty Profile - Physical Facilities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Age - Gender - Nationality - Socio-economic - Program expectation - Faculty Development Program Educational Background - Experience - Length of teaching - Adequacy of book and journal - Periodically - Adequacy of computers - Adequacy of software 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mean & standard deviation of Age, salary of parent - Compare program and implementation - Qualified to teach analysis - Mean & standard deviation of them
Process	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Implementation of Program experience of administrator, teacher, students - How to solve that Solution 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Compare between program and implementation - Analyzed result of solution 	- Descriptive analysis
Product	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Performance of alumni and employers 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Length of time they got job after graduation - Nature of current jobs (managerial/non managerial, permanent/probationary) - Weaknesses of Graduate 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Questionnaire - Attitude indicated in the objective and goal of the program

DATA ANALYSIS

The study will use two type data treatments namely quantitative analysis and qualitative :

- a) Quantitative analysis will involve use of means, standard deviation, frequencies and percentage to present findings.
- b) Qualitative analysis will be done for the regarding of the vision-mission statement, objective/goals of the program, problem met in implementation of the program solution made by administrators, teachers, and students to overcome those problems. Feedback of employer about job performance of graduates.

VII RESULT OF EVALUATION

The significant findings of the study are as follow :

1. Context evaluation

The vision-mission of Indonesian cooperative management institute is to be a center of excellence in the development of cooperatives and small to medium enterprises. It has a triple mission focusing on education, research, and public services. It aims to prepare candidates for management of cooperative and medium, small enterprises and human resources; managers who have a pure hearts, and are capable of helping solve associated problem through several activities such as training, consultancy, assistance, and other services.

The goals and objectives of the HRM program of IKOPIN were to produce graduates who are loyal to One God and unity with integrity; intelligent, professionals who are discipline, innovative, and productivities, and experts in management, specially in human resource management.

2. Input Evaluation

The model age are range of the students was 20 to 21 years (41%). A big percentage (57%) belonged to low-income families.

The lecturer's educational backgrounds were mostly agriculture.

Provision for computer and HRM software was very limited.

Library holdings for HRM were very limited, especially for professional journals in the field.

Faculty academic backgrounds were mostly in agriculture and some lecturers employed teaching strategies that bored students.

3. Process Evaluation

HRM program implementation problems included low salaries of administrators and lecturers. Assignment of more than three courses preparation; lack of information dissemination regarding the HRM program which effected enrollment; lack of sufficient information regarding expected job-entry skills of HRM graduates; insufficient off-campus activities and absence of a practicum component to acquaint student with actual work demands and conditions, and boring institution on the part of some lectures. Other problems included lack of student motivation to study and to do research in the library, and students personal biases in evaluating faculty.

To overcome three problem's, IKOPIN institute a number of policies to “ (a) increase enrollment of children of IKOPIN members in the program through application for scholarship; (b) increase salaries of lecturers and of administrators through funded research project, (c) annually gather information regarding expectation of cooperatives as regards entry skills knowledge, and attributes of HRM graduates.

4. Product Evaluation

Length of time spent by HRM graduates before getting their first jobs ranged from one to four years. About 46% of them held non-managerial positions, and 70% were not employed in cooperatives or in human resource management position. Cooperatives refrained from hiring HRM graduates of IKOPIN.

VIII CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

Conclusions

Based on findings of the study, the following conclusions were drawn :

1. There is congruence between the vision-mission of IKOPIN and the goals and objectives of the HRM program.
2. The resources of IKOPIN do not adequately support the HRM program. This apply to both its human and material resources.
3. Problems met during program implementation are mostly severe, particularly, job placement and nature of work of graduates.
4. The HRM program of IKOPIN has not been successful in achieving its objectives.

Recommendation

1. The vision-mission of IKOPIN should be promoted by IKOPIN, to make cooperative societies know what IKOPIN mission and vision.
2. Qualification of applicants for teaching position should be considered, specially this academic preparation. The current groups of lecturers should undergo gynoprivate development program in

human resource management and human instructional approaches that can sustain students interest and attention.

3. Increase library holdings and acquire journals an HRM.

4. Make the HRM program responsive to the needs and expectations in cooperative societies, for this purpose :

Implement the suggestion of the participant for the improvement of the program.

Hold periodic meeting with employees of HRM graduates to improve the HRM curriculum, based on labor market demands.

Conduct periodic dialogues with faculty, students and alumni on how the program could be continuously improved.

5. For future research, conduct evaluation of IKOPIN HRM program periodically, for its continuous improvement.
6. Future research can focus on the evaluation of the other IKOPIN programs
7. A replication of the study may be conducted in other universities or colleges in Indonesia for comparative and validation purposes.

REFERENCES

Alwasilah, A. Ch. (1994). Teaching technology in our educational system. Jakarta: PT. Media Publisher.

Bishop, L. J. (1976). Staff development and instructional improvement: Plans and procedures. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.

Borromeo, R. (1983) Strategies for effective school management. Quezon City, Philippines: Phoenix.

Bolton, Dale L. (1974). Evaluating School Process and Products : A Responsibility of School Principals, In J. Culbertson, C. Henson, and Morrison (eds). Performance Objectives for School Principals : Concepts and Instruments. Berkeley : Mc. Cutchan Publishing Corp.

Cooperative Department, Center for Education and Training Cooperative (1989). Cooperative education, Jakarta: Cooperative Department Publisher.

Cooperative Department. (1991). 1945. Constitution of Republic of Indonesia. Jakarta: Cooperative Department Publisher.

Cooperative Department. (1991). Cooperative Law Number 12 of the year 1967 concerning basic regulations for cooperatives. Jakarta: Cooperative Department Publisher.

Cooperative Department (1992). Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 25 of the year 1992 Concerning Cooperative. Jakarta: Cooperative Department Publisher.

Department of Education and Culture (1992). Collection of laws and regulations Republic of Indonesia. Jakarta: Education Department Publisher.

Department of Education (1992). Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 2 of the year 1989. Concerning National Education System and Implementation Regulation. Jakarta: Sinar Grafika.

Indonesian Cooperative Management Institute (1999/2000). Guidance of education program for undergraduate and diploma. Bandung, Jatinangor: Indonesian Cooperative Management Institute Schooling and Academic Administration Bureau: IKOPIN Publishing. Bandung.

Indonesian Cooperative Management Institute (2001). Guidance of education program for undergraduate and diploma. Bandung, Jatinangor: Indonesian Cooperative Management Institute Schooling and Academic Administration Bureau: IKOPIN Publishing. Bandung.

Johnston, I. & Mc. Clelland, B. (1991). The changing in Prior. J. (Ed.), England: Gower Hand Book.

Prakash, D. (1987). Management of cooperative training in Indonesia: Some recent developments in Selecting cooperative development in Indonesia. Jakarta: The National Center for Cooperative Training and Development Publisher.

Stufflebeam, D.L. et. al (1971). Educational Evaluation and Decision Making (In Educational Evaluation): Theory and Practice. CA : Wadsworth Publishing Company, Inc. Belmont California.